# OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH REVIEW COMMISSION



## RALEIGH, NORTH CAROLINA

COMMISSIONER OF LABOR FOR	)	DOCKET NO: 2014 - 5563
THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA	)	
	)	INSPECTION
	)	NO: 317280907
Complainant,	)	
	)	CSHO ID: D04
<b>v.</b>	)	
JOE TALLEY dba JOE TALLEY	)	FINAL ORDER
and its successors	)	
Respondent.	)	

THIS CAUSE coming on pursuant to the Order of Pre-Hearing Conference ("Hearing Order") on October 23, 2014 at the Lee House, 2nd Floor Hearing Room, 422 North Blount Street, Raleigh, North Carolina at 10:30 a.m. Rory Agan, Assistant Attorney General appeared as counsel for the Complainant, and Joseph Talley the Respondent appeared for the Respondent.

Pursuant to the Hearing Order a pre-hearing conference (the "Hearing") was held for the purpose of considering matters which would simplify the issues and expedite the proceedings in the above referenced case. No affected employee of Respondent, or its representative, attended to have a say in, or participate as a party in, the Hearing. At the Hearing Complainant and Respondent notified the Undersigned that the parties wish to agree upon certain stipulations ("Stipulations") and to make certain motions ("Motions").

This Hearing was not an evidentiary hearing and the specific facts and circumstances relevant to the Inspection (hereinafter defined) and the Original Citation (hereinafter defined) were not introduced of record, and such facts and circumstances are not included in the Stipulations hereinafter set forth. Based on the Original Citation and the Statement of Employer's/Respondent's Position, it appears that no injuries were sustained, that an inspection was conducted while Respondent was providing framing services at a residential construction site, and that Complainant issued one citation as follows: "Citation 1" consisting of the following: Item 1a, 1b and 1c (grouped), relating to Respondent's safety and health program, designated as 'serious' with an assessed penalty of \$1,500.00; Item 2, relating to failure to wear

Joe Talley dba Joe Talley 2014-5563

head protection, fall protection and ladder access, designated as 'serious' with an assessed penalty of \$600.00; Item 3, relating to failure to wear eye and face protective equipment, designated as 'serious' with an assessed penalty of \$600.00; Item 4, relating to failure to provide a training program to minimize hazards related to ladders and stairways, designated as 'serious' with an assessed penalty of \$450.00; and Item 5, relating to failure to provide a training program with respect to fall protection, designated as 'serious' with an assessed penalty of \$900.00; Respondent admitted such alleged violations but denied the serious classification of each and objected to each penalty.

As a result of this Hearing, Complainant and Respondent request that the Stipulations and Motions be made part of the Hearing record and that the Undersigned issue a Final Order. The Stipulations and Motions are as follows:

#### **STIPULATIONS**

- 1. The Complainant as Commissioner of Labor of the State of North Carolina is charged by law with compliance with and enforcement of the provisions of the Occupational Safety and Health Act of North Carolina (the "Act"). The Review Commission has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter to this action.
- 2. Respondent is a North Carolina sole proprietorship, duly organized and existing under the laws of the State of North Carolina, which does business in the State of North Carolina and maintains a place of business in Grandy, North Carolina. Respondent is in the business of residential construction and remodeling. Respondent is an "employer" within the meaning of N.C.G.S. Section 95-127(10); all of Respondent's employees referred to in this matter are "employees" within the meaning of N.C.G.S. Section 95-127(9).
- 3. On October 21, 2013, an Occupational Safety and Health Compliance Officer with the North Carolina Department of Labor conducted an inspection of Respondent's worksite located at Lot 3, Putters Lane in Kitty Hawk, North Carolina (the "Inspection").
- 4. As a result of the Inspection, on December 3, 2013, Complainant issued a citation ("Citation 1") as more specifically described on **Exhibit "A"** (also sometimes referred to herein as the "Original Citation").
- 5. Respondent submitted a timely Notice of Contest.
- 6. A Hearing in this matter was scheduled pursuant to the Rules of Procedure of the Safety and Health Review Commission of North Carolina (the "Rules").
- 7. Neither party has any objection, procedural or otherwise, to this Hearing.
- 8. Respondent posted the Original Citation and the Hearing Order as required by the Rules. Neither Complainant nor Respondent have received notification from any affected employee that such employee, or its representative, wishes to have a say in, or participate as a party in, this

Joe Talley dba Joe Talley 2014-5563

matter, or has any objections in connection with this matter including without limitation objection to the reasonableness of any abatement period.

- 9. Respondent agrees that the violations alleged in Citation 1 have been abated.
- 10. The parties agree that upon granting of Complainant's Motion the penalty for each Item designated in the Original Citation as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion has been calculated in accordance with the standard Field Operations Manual procedure and giving consideration by Complainant to standard mitigating factors.

#### 12. Respondent agrees

- \* to pay the penalty assessed in this matter of \$1,170.00 in 12 equal monthly installments of \$97.50 each, with the first installment due and payable on the first business day of December, 2014. All subsequent installments shall be due and payable on the first business day of each month thereafter. In no event shall the payment term extend beyond a consecutive 12 month period, unless agreed upon by the Complainant. In the event Respondent does not pay each monthly installment as agreed upon, all remaining installments become immediately due and payable, and the Complainant retains the right to institute collection proceeding as allowed by law. Respondent agrees to pay attorney's fees to Complainant in the event that the Complainant has to institute collection proceedings to collect the debt.
- 13. The parties agree to bear their own fees, costs and other expenses, including attorney's fees if any, that have been incurred in connection with any stage of these proceedings up to and including the filing of this Order except as provided in Stipulation 12 above.
- Complainant and Respondent agree that provided the respective Motions of each party 14. are granted there are no other matters that remain to be decided, and that other than a ruling with respect to the Motions no outstanding issues remain to be resolved by an evidentiary hearing of this matter. The parties agree that this Final Order is a full and final resolution of the claims set out in the underlying Original Citation, as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion. The parties further agree that (i) the modification of any portion of the Original Citation by Complainant shall not be deemed to be an admission by Complainant that any such portion was alleged without merit, and (ii)none of the foregoing agreements, statements, stipulations and actions taken by Respondent shall be deemed an admission by the Respondent of any of the allegations contained in the Original Citation as amended or waiver of defenses; provided however that in any subsequent proceeding with respect to matters covered by this Final Order brought directly under the Act by Complainant, this Final Order shall have the full force and effect of a final order. The agreements, statements, stipulations and actions herein by Complainant and by Respondent are solely for the purpose of resolving this matter economically and amicably without litigation and shall not be used for any other purpose except for proceedings and matters arising under the Act and Article 21, Chapter 95 of the North Carolina General Statutes.

#### **MOTIONS**

Complainant moved to do the following ("Complainant's Motion"):

Joe Talley dba Joe Talley 2014-5563

\*amend Citation 1 as follows: reduce the penalty for grouped Item 1(a), 1(b) and 1(c) to \$390.00; group Items 2 and 3 with a single penalty of \$390.00; and group Items 4 and 5 with a single penalty of \$390.00; the total of the assessed penalty being \$1,170.00; each Item remains classified as 'serious';

except as set forth in this motion, the Original Citation shall remain unmodified or amended.

Respondent did not object to Complainant's Motion.

Respondent requested that upon the granting of Complainant's Motion that the Undersigned consider the following motion by the Respondent ("Respondent's Motion"), and Respondent confirmed that the violations alleged in the Original Citation as amended have been abated:

\*to withdraw Respondent's Notice of Contest to the Original Citation as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion set forth above.

Complainant did not object to Respondent's Motion.

### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

Based on the Stipulations at the time of the Hearing and the record, the Undersigned makes the following Findings of Fact:

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this Hearing.
- 2. Respondent is subject to the provisions of the Act and jurisdiction of the Safety and Health Review Commission of North Carolina.
- 3. Neither party has any procedural objection to this Hearing.
- 4. Complainant, Commissioner of Labor of the State of North Carolina, is an agency of the State of North Carolina charged with the administration and enforcement of the provisions of the Occupational Safety and Health Act of North Carolina, Article 16, Chapter 95 of the General Statutes of North Carolina (hereinafter "the Act").
- 5. The Stipulations are incorporated by reference as Findings of Fact to the extent necessary to give effect to the provisions of this Order.

#### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

The foregoing Findings of Fact are incorporated by reference as Conclusions of Law to the extent necessary to give effect to the provisions of this Order.

## NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

- 1. That Complainant's Motion is hereby **GRANTED**; and
- 2. That Respondent's Motion is hereby **GRANTED**.

This the 23 day of October, 2014.

R. Joyce Garrett

Administrative Law Judge

**CONSENTED TO:** 

Rory Agan

Attorney for Complainant

Joseph Talley, Respondent Representative for Respondent

# Exhibit "A"

# **Original Citation**

# **CITATION NUMBER 1 (Type of Violation: Serious)**

Item No.	Standard	<b>Abatement Date</b>	<b>Penalty</b>
Grouped			
1a	29 CFR 1926.20(b)(2)	12/11/1013	\$1,500.00
1b	29 CFR 1926.501(b)(13)	Immediately Abated	
1c	29 CFR 1926.1053(b)(1)	Immediately Abated	
2	29 CFR 1926.100(a)	Immediately Abated	\$ 600.00
3	29 CFR 1926.102(a)(1)	Immediately Abated	\$ 600.00
4	29 CFR 1926.1060(a)	12/11/2013	\$ 450.00
5	29 CFR 1926.503(a))1)	12/11/1013	\$ 900.00
		TOTAL	4,050.00

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I have this date served a copy of the foregoing FINAL ORDER upon:

JOSEPH TALLEY 685 GRANDY ROAD GRANDY NC 27939

RORY AGAN
NC DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
LABOR SECTION
PO BOX 629
RALEIGH NC 27602-0629

by depositing a copy of the same in the United States Mail, Certified Mail, postage prepaid, at Raleigh, North Carolina, and upon:

NC DEPARTMENT OF LABOR LEGAL AFFAIRS DIVISION 1101 MAIL SERVICE CENTER RALEIGH NC 27699-1101

by depositing a copy of the same in the NCDOL Interoffice Mail.

OSCAR A. KELLER, JR.

CHARMAN

Nancy D. Swaney

Docket and Office Administrator

NC Occupational Safety & Health Review Commission

1101 Mail Service Center Raleigh, NC 27699-1101

TEL.: (919) 733-3589 FAX: (919) 733-3020