#### BEFORE THE NORTH CAROLINA

#### OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH REVIEW COMMISSION

#### RALEIGH, NORTH CAROLINA

COMMISSIONER OF LABOR OF	)	DOCKET NO: 20	20-6279
THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA	)		DITTO BE ATTENDED
	)	INSPECTION	FLED
Complainant,	)	NO: 318180338	
	)		OCT - 6 2022
<b>v.</b>	)	<b>CSHO ID: C9882</b>	000 0 0000
	)		NC Occupational & Safety
CASE FARMS, LLC	)	FINAL ORDER	NO Occupational & Safety Finalism Commission
and its successors	)		B. Kimiri C. William C. W. C.
Respondent.	)		

THIS CAUSE came on for hearing and was heard before the undersigned Reagan H Weaver, Hearing Examiner for the North Carolina Occupational Safety and Health Review Commission, on September 27, 2022 pursuant to a Notice of Hearing. Rory Agan, Assistant Attorney General, North Carolina Department of Justice, appeared for the Complainant. Travis W. Vance, Fisher & Phillips, Charlotte, North Carolina, appeared for the Respondent. No affected employee of Respondent, or its representative, attended to have a say in, or participate as a party in, the Hearing.

At the time of the Hearing the parties agreed upon and consented to the following Stipulations.

#### **STIPULATIONS**

- 1. The Complainant as Commissioner of Labor of the State of North Carolina is charged by law with compliance with and enforcement of the provisions of the Occupational Safety and Health Act of North Carolina, Article 16, Chapter 95 of the General Statutes of North Carolina (hereinafter "the Act"). The Review Commission has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter to this action.
- 2. Respondent is a Delaware limited liability company, duly organized and authorized to do business under the laws of the State of North Carolina, which does business in the State of North Carolina and maintains a place of business in Morganton, North Carolina. Respondent is an "employer" as defined by N.C.G.S. Section 95-127(11) and it maintains employees as defined by N.C.G.S. Section 95-127(10).

- 3. During the period between October 8, 2019 and February 24, 2020, Leighton Dowdle, an Occupational Safety and Health Compliance Officer with the North Carolina Department of Labor, conducted an inspection of Respondent's worksite located at 121 Rand Street in Morganton, North Carolina (the "Inspection").
- 4. As a result of the Inspection, on March 31, 2020, Complainant issued the following Citation and Notification of Penalty (herein collectively referred to as the "Original Citation"):

Citation	Item	Standard	Туре	Penalty
1	1a	1910.147(c)(4)(i)	Serious	\$7,000.00
1	1b	1910.147(d)(2)	Serious	\$Grouped
1	2	1910.147(c)(6)(i)	Serious	\$7,000.00
1	3	1910.147(c)(7)(i)(A)	Serious	\$7,000.00
1	4	1910.212(a)(1)	Serious	\$7,000.00

- 5. Respondent submitted a timely Notice of Contest.
- 6. The Hearing in this matter was scheduled pursuant to the Rules of Procedure of the Safety and Health Review Commission of North Carolina (the "Rules").
- 7. Complainant and Respondent agreed that the Hearing in this matter shall be conducted via the video conferencing platform known as "Lifesize", the presence of a court reporter during the Hearing is waived, the Hearing's audio and video will be recorded through Lifesize (the "Recording"), the Recording will be the official record of the Hearing, and the Hearing will be deemed to have taken place in Raleigh, North Carolina. Complainant and Respondent have no objection, either procedural or otherwise, to this Hearing and both parties consent to the conduct of this Hearing by the Undersigned and to entry of this Final Order.
- 8. Respondent posted the Original Citation and the Notice of Hearing as required by the Rules. Neither Complainant nor Respondent have received notification from any affected employee that such employee, or its representative, wishes to have a say in, or participate as a party in, this matter, or has any objections in connection with this matter including without limitation objection to the reasonableness of any abatement period.
- 9. Respondent confirms that the violations alleged in the Original Citation as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion have been abated. **No abatement documentation is required.**

- 10. The parties agree to bear their own attorney's fees, costs and other expenses that have been incurred in connection with any stage of these proceedings up to and including the filing of this Final Order.
- Complainant and Respondent agree that provided the respective Motions of each party 11. are granted (a) there are no other matters that remain to be decided, and that other than a ruling with respect to the Motions no outstanding issues remain to be resolved by an evidentiary hearing of this matter; (b) this Order is a full and final resolution of the claim set out in the underlying Original Citation, as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion; (c) the modification of any portion of the Original Citation by Complainant shall not be deemed to be an admission by Complainant that any such portion was alleged without merit, (d) none of the agreements, statements, stipulations and actions taken by Respondent shall be deemed an admission by the Respondent of any of the allegations contained in the Original Citation as amended or waiver of defenses; provided however that in any subsequent proceeding with respect to matters covered by this Order brought directly under the Act by Complainant, this Order shall have the full force and effect of a final order; (e) the agreements, statements, stipulations and actions herein by Complainant and by Respondent are solely for the purpose of resolving this matter economically and amicably without further litigation and shall not be used for any other purpose except for proceedings and matters arising under the Act and Article 21, Chapter 95 of the North Carolina General Statutes; (f) the penalty for each Item designated in the Original Citation as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion has been calculated in accordance with the standard Field Operations Manual procedure and giving consideration by Complainant to standard mitigating factors and to specific factors applicable to Respondent; and (g) there has been no employee objection to the reasonableness of any abatement period.

# 12. Respondent agrees to:

- a. Respondent will pay the penalty of \$5,000.00 assessed in this matter by November 15, 2022 (payment is to be by check payable to North Carolina Department of Labor, OSHA Division (identifying Inspection No. 318180338)) and mailed to North Carolina Department of Labor, NC Department of Labor Budget & Management Division, Attn: Collections Division, 1101 Mail Service Center, Raleigh, North Carolina 27699-1101;
- b. Retrain affected employees at Morganton facility on lockout/tagout. The training shall include the specific activities that are considered servicing and/or maintenance under 29 CFR 1910.147 (e.g. clearing jams, making adjustments, cleaning, etc.) and how those activities are prohibited unless the machine is locked-out or a guard is in place that prevents exposure to the danger area;
- Retrain affected employees at Morganton facility to contact supervisors in the event of a jam;
- d. Conduct an internal machine guarding evaluation for the front half department of the Morganton facility; and
- e. Certify that the above listed steps have been taken to the North Carolina Department of Labor by February 1, 2023. No other abatement documentation is required.

#### **MOTIONS**

Complainant moved to do the following ("Complainant's Motion"):

**a.** Amend the citations and associated penalties as follows for a new total balance of all penalties of \$5,000.00.

Citation	Item	Standard	Туре	Penalty
1	1	1910.147(c)(1)	Serious	\$5,000.00

**b**. Rewrite the AVD to state: Respondent did not establish a lock-out tagout program required by this section at a time prior to the issuance of this Citation.

Except as set forth in this motion, the Original Citation shall remain unmodified or amended.

Respondent did not object to Complainant's Motion.

Respondent requested that upon the granting of Complainant's Motion that the Undersigned consider the following motion by the Respondent ("Respondent's Motion"):

a. To withdraw Respondent's Notice of Contest to the Original Citation as amended pursuant to Complainant's Motion set forth above.

Complainant did not object to Respondent's Motion.

# FINDINGS OF FACT

Based on the Stipulations at the time of the Hearing and the record, the Undersigned makes the following Findings of Fact:

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this Hearing.
- 2. Respondent is subject to the provisions of the Act and jurisdiction of the Safety and Health Review Commission of North Carolina.
- 3. Neither party has any objection, procedural or otherwise, to this Hearing.
- 4. Complainant, Commissioner of Labor of the State of North Carolina, is an agency of the State of North Carolina charged with the administration and enforcement of the provisions of the Act.

5. The Stipulations are incorporated by reference as Findings of Fact to the extent necessary to give effect to the provisions of this Order.

## **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

The foregoing Findings of Fact are incorporated by reference as Conclusions of Law to the extent necessary to give effect to the provisions of this Order.

# NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

- 1. That Complainant's Motion is hereby **GRANTED**; and
- 2. That Respondent's Motion is hereby **GRANTED**; Respondent shall pay the penalty of \$5,000.00 in the manner set forth in the Stipulations.

This the \_\_\_\_ day of Oct 6, 2022, 2022.

Reagan Weaver (Oct 6, 2022 15:46 EDT)

Reagan Weaver Hearing Examiner

CONSENTED TO:

KOYY AGAN

Rory Agan (Oct 6, 2022 09:31 FDT)

Rory Agan Assistant Attorney General NCDOJ-Labor Section 114 W. Edenton Street Raleigh, North Carolina 27603 Travis W. Vance
Travis W. Vance (Oct 6, 2022 09:42 EDT)

Travis W. Vance
Partner
Fisher & Phillips, LLP
227 West Trade Street, Suite 2020
Charlotte, North Carolina 28202

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I have this date served a copy of the foregoing ORDER upon:

TRAVIS W. VANCE FISHER & PHILLIPS, LLP 227 WEST TRADE ST. SUITE 2020 CHARLOTTE, NC 28202

By depositing same in the United States Mail, Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested, postage prepaid at Raleigh, North Carolina, and upon:

RORY AGAN NC DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE LABOR SECTION PO BOX 629 RALEIGH, NC 27602-0629

By depositing a copy of the same in the United States Mail, first class, postage prepaid at Raleigh, North Carolina, and upon:

NC DEPARTMENT OF LABOR LEGAL AFFAIRS DIVISION 1101 MAIL SERVICE CENTER RALEIGH, NC 27699-1101

via email to carla.rose@labor.nc.gov.

THIS THE \_\_\_\_\_ DAY OF October 2022.

Karissa B. Stuss

Docket and Office Administrator

NC Occupational Safety & Health Review Commission

1101 Mail Service Center Raleigh, NC 27699-1101

TEL.: (919) 733-3589

NCOSHRC@labor.nc.gov